

**The Development of *Australia's Oceans Policy*: Change and
Stability in a Policy Community**

by

Joanna Vince, BA (Hons)

**Submitted in fulfilment for the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy**

University of Tasmania

June 2004

DECLARATION

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for a degree or diploma by the University of Tasmania or any other institution, except by way of background information and duly acknowledged in the thesis, and to the best of my knowledge and belief no material previously published or written by another person except where due acknowledgement is made in the text of the thesis.

Joanna Vince
June 2004

ACCESS AUTHORITY

This thesis may be reproduced, archived, and communicated in any material form in whole or in part by the University of Tasmania or its agents, and may be made available for loan and limited copying in accordance with the *Copyright Act 1968*.

Joanna Vince
June 2004

ABSTRACT

In December 1998, the Howard Government released *Australia's Oceans Policy*, a major initiative focused at providing a framework for implementing integrated ecosystem based management of Australia's vast marine domain. This thesis utilises a policy community approach to review the processes and institutions that led to the development of *Australia's Oceans Policy*. It argues that despite significant policy change affected by both external and domestic policy drivers, a key element in shaping responses to the policy has been stability within the policy community shaped paradoxically by 'offshore federalism' that has made it difficult to implement a fully integrated oceans policy.

Analysis of the development and implementation of the *Australia's Oceans Policy* indicates that change to ocean related policies embodied in the policy framework have been driven by several interrelated factors. These include debates over appropriate management of resources within and between sectoral groups; coordination of marine resource management between state and Commonwealth governments; and Commonwealth commitments to international instruments. New institutional arrangements established by *Australia's Oceans Policy* such as the National Oceans Office, National Oceans Ministerial Board, National Oceans Advisory Group and Regional Marine Plan Steering Committees, reflect a commitment towards integrated ocean management but at the same time confront the legal and jurisdictional framework established following a quarter century of 'offshore federalism'.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This thesis could not have been completed without the support of family, friends and colleagues at the University of Tasmania. I would like to particularly thank the following people for their continual encouragement and faith in my work:

Dr Marcus Haward for his tireless efforts and constant support in supervising the completion of this thesis. Marcus, you inspired me to pursue my interests in this area through your enthusiasm for all issues relating to oceans. I greatly appreciate this.

Dr Robert Hall for being a regular source of motivation and advice since my Honours year. Thanks for being my associate supervisor and for waiting so patiently to see my drafts!

My friends from the Tasman Peninsula who helped me enjoy life whilst writing my thesis. I would like to give special thanks to Lyn Hallam and Robin Plummer for their encouragement and help.

My parents, without whose love and assistance I would not be pursuing my dream. Also many thanks to my grandparents, parents-in-law, brother, sisters-in-law and extended family for all their support.

Lastly, but most importantly, many thanks to my loving partner Brendon who is my rock. Thanks for your never-ending support, belief and confidence in me and my work.

ACRONYMS

Agriculture, Fisheries and Forestry Australia	AFFA
Asian Pacific Economic Cooperation	APEC
Australian and New Zealand Environment and Conservation Council	ANZECC
Australian Bureau of Agricultural and Resource Economics	ABARE
Australian Committee for the World Conservation Union	ACIUCN
Australian Conservation Foundation	ACF
Australian Fisheries Council	AFC
Australian Fisheries Management Authority	AFMA
Australian Fishing Industry Council	AFIC
Australian Fishing Zone	AFZ
Australian Geological Survey Organisation	AGSO
Australian Local Governments Association	ALGA
Australian Marine Industries and Sciences Council	AMISC
Australian Marine Science and Technology Company	AMSAT
Australian Nature Conservation Agency	ANCA
Australian Public Service	APS
Broken Hill Propriety	BHP
Convention for the Conservation of Antarctic Marine Living Resources	CCAMLR
Convention on the Regulation of Antarctic Mineral Resource Activities	CRAMRA
Council of Australian Governments	COAG
Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation	CSIRO
Department of Environment, Sport and Territories	DEST
Department of Industry, Science and Resources	DISR
Department of Transport and Regional Services	DOTRS
Ecologically Sustainable Development	ESD
Exclusive Economic Zone	EEZ
Fishing Industry Policy Council of Australia	FIPCA
Global Environmental Outlook	GEO
Great Barrier Reef Marine Park Authority	GBRMPA
Heads of Marine Agencies Group	HOMA

House of Representatives Standing Committee on Environment and Conservation	HORSCEC
House of Representatives Standing Committee on Environment, Recreation and the Arts	HORSCERA
Humane Society International	HIS
Intergovernmental Agreement on the Environment	IGAE
Marine and Coastal Community Network	MCCN
Marine Protected Area	MPA
Marine Protected Areas	MPAs
Marine Resource Conservation Working Group	MRC
Memorandum of Understanding	MOU
Ministerial Advisory Group on Oceans Policy	MAGOP
Multilateral High Level Conference	MHLC
National Coastal Action Program	NCAP
National Fishing Industry Council	NFIC
National Oceans Advisory Group	NOAG
National Oceans Office	NOO
Natural Heritage Trust	NHT
Nongovernmental Organisation	NGO
Ocean Rescue 2000	OR 2000
Offshore Constitutional Settlement	OCS
Pacific Forum Fisheries Agency	FFA
Regional Marine Plans	RMPs
Resource Assessment Commission	RAC
South East Regional Marine Plan	SERMP
State of the Marine Environment Report	SOMER
Sustainable Development Advisory Committee	SDAC
Third Meeting of the United Nations Conference on the Law of the Sea	UNCLOS III
United Nations Commission on Sustainable Development	CSD
United Nations Conference on Environment and Development	UNCED
United Nations Environment Program	UNEP
United Nations Law of the Sea Convention	LOSC
Western and Central Pacific	WCP
World Conservation Union	IUCN
World Wide Fund for Nature	WWF

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Declaration	ii
Abstract	iii
Acknowledgements	iv
Acronyms	v
Table of Contents	vii
Tables and Figures	x
 <u>Introduction</u>	 1
 <u>Chapter One</u>	
Policy Communities, Policy Change and Policy Transfer	
1. Introduction	11
2. American Research	13
3. British Research	19
4. Assessing British and American Research	29
5. Canadian Research	32
6. Australian Research	41
7. Policy Change	46
8. Policy Transfer as a Model of Policy Change	48
9. Policy Transfer Networks and the Policy Community	59
10. Other Avenues of Change within the Policy Community?	63
11. Conclusion	67
 <u>Chapter Two</u>	
Ocean and Marine Resource Management: Federation to 1990	
1. Introduction	69
2. The Constitution, Federalism and Intergovernmental Relations	71
3. Fisheries	76
3.1 Pre-Federation to <i>Commonwealth Fisheries and Pearl Fisheries Acts</i> 1952	76
3.2 The Development of Commonwealth Fisheries Administration	84
4. Offshore Oil and Petroleum Mining	88
4.1 The Offshore Policy Developments During the 1960s	88
4.2 The Offshore Policy Developments During the 1970s	93
5. The 1979 Offshore Constitutional Settlement (OCS)	98
5.1 The Legislative Package	100
5.2 The Offshore 'Petroleum Package'	103
5.3 The Fisheries Package	103
5.4 The Great Barrier Reef Package	105
6. Intergovernmental Relations Following the Enactment of the Offshore Constitutional Settlement	106
7. Conclusion	107

Chapter Three

Ocean and Coastal Policy Developments During the 1980s and 1990s

1. Introduction	110
2. Marine Science and Technology	111
3. Ocean Rescue 2000	113
4. The Intergovernmental Agreement on the Environment	116
5. Ecologically Sustainable Development	120
6. Coastal Zone Management - Commonwealth	125
7. Coastal Zone Management - State Responses	141
8. Conclusion	151

Chapter Four

External Factors and their Impact on the Development of *Australia's Oceans Policy*

1. Introduction	153
2. International Instruments and Ocean Regimes	155
2.1 The Law of the Sea	156
2.2 Prevention of Pollution	162
2.3 The Antarctic Treaty and Australia's Antarctic and Southern Ocean Maritime Responsibilities	164
2.4 UNCED	170
2.5 UNEP	175
2.6 Regional Influences	177
3. External Domestic Influences	183
3.1 The Legacy of New Federalism During Oceans Policy Development	184
3.2 Changes to the Public Service and the Development of Ocean Institutions	187
4. Conclusion	192

Chapter Five

Australia's Ocean Policy – The Development Process 1997-1998

1. Introduction	194
2. Why an Oceans Policy?	196
3. The Oceans Policy Process	202
4. Marine Science and Technology	211
5. Issues and Background Papers	213
6. The MAGOP Report and the "Draft" Policy Document	226
7. NGO Responses to the Issues Paper	235
8. MAGOP's Response to the Issues Paper	237
9. Conclusion: The Final Steps Prior to the Release of <i>Australia's Oceans Policy</i>	237

Chapter Six

Australia's Oceans Policy Development and Implementation Process 1998 – 2003

1. Introduction	240
2. The Release of <i>Australia's Oceans Policy</i>	241
3. <i>Australia's Marine Science and Technology Plan</i>	247
4. The Roles of New and Existing Institutional Arrangements	250
4.1 The National Oceans Ministerial Board	252
4.2 The National Oceans Office	253
4.3 The National Oceans Advisory Group	258
4.4 ANZECC	259
4.5 Regional Marine Plan Steering Committees	260
5. The Implementation Process	261
6. Responses to <i>Australia's Oceans Policy</i> and its Implementation	271
7. Conclusion	276

Chapter Seven

Australia's Oceans Policy Community: A Continuum in Marine Policy Development

1. Introduction	278
2. Australia's Oceans Policy Community 1982 – 1983: The Implementation of the Offshore Constitutional Settlement	280
2.1 OCS Policy Community – Membership	280
2.2 OCS Policy Community – Integration	284
2.3 OCS Policy Community - Resources and Power	284
3. Australia's Oceans Policy Community 1997 – 1998: The Development of <i>Australia's Oceans Policy</i>	285
3.1 Oceans Policy Community 1997 - 1998 Membership	287
3.2 Oceans Policy Community 1997 - 1998 Integration	288
3.3 Oceans Policy Community 1997 - 1998 Resources and Power	289
4. Australia's Oceans Policy Community 2001 – 2003: The Implementation of <i>Australia's Oceans Policy</i> - The Development of the South East Regional Marine Plan	290
4.1 Oceans Policy Community 2001 - 2003 Membership	292
4.2 Oceans Policy Community 2001 – 2003 Integration	296
4.3 Oceans Policy Community 2001– 2003 Resources and Power	297
5. Stability and Change within Australia's Oceans Policy Community	298
5.1 Management of Ocean Resources and Intergovernmental Coordination	299
5.2 External Pressures	312
5.2.1 State Parties to International Instruments	312
5.2.2 Public Sector Reforms	318
5.3 Stability in the Oceans Policy Community	318
6. Changes Beyond 2003 – Conclusion	320

Conclusion

322

References

327

TABLES AND FIGURES

FIGURES

1.1 Theoretical Relationships Among Three Kinds of Intergovernmental Networks	18
1.2 Dimensions of Policy Style	21
1.3 The Policy Community	34
1.4 From Lesson-Drawing to Coercive Transfer	55
1.5 The Amended Policy Community	62
 6.1 The Institutional Arrangements for <i>Australia's Oceans Policy</i>	 251
 7.1 Australia's Oceans Policy Community During the Implementation of the Offshore Constitutional Settlement 1982 – 1983	 281
7.2 Australia's Oceans Policy Community During the Development of <i>Australia's Oceans Policy</i> 1997 – 1998	286
7.3 Australia's Oceans Policy Community During the Implementation of <i>Australia's Oceans Policy</i> 2001 – 2003	291

TABLES

1.1 Types of Policy Networks: Characteristics of Policy Communities and Issue Networks	24
1.2 Policy Community and Policy Network: the Wilks and Wright Model	28
1.3 Groupings of Policy Networks	37
1.4 Categories of Actors in an Amended Policy Community Approach	45
1.5 A Policy Transfer Framework	53
1.6 The Characteristics of Policy Communities, Epistemic Communities, Policy Transfer Networks and Change Networks	65
 3.1 Summary of Recommendations Related to Institutional Arrangements to Manage the Australian Coastal Zone	 135
3.2 Outline of Current Status of State and Territory Coastal Policies	146
 7.1 Policy Actions that Changed Ocean Policy Development and the Oceans Policy Community	 301